The Translation Quality of Transitivity System in the Book of the Memoirs of Sherlock Holmes

Halimatus Sa'adah[1]; M.R. Nababan[2]; and Riyadi Santosa[2]

[1] Student of Linguistics Department at Sebelas Maret University, Surakarta, Indonesia

[2] Professor of Linguistics at Sebelas Maret University, Surakarta, Indonesia

Abstract

This research aims to analyze the translation quality of transitivity in the book of The Memoirs of Sherlock Holmes. The method used in this research is descriptive qualitative with a functional systemic approach. To validate the data, the researcher used content analysis and FGD (Forum Group Discussion) with three raters. The research assess translation quality in three aspects, there are accuracy, acceptability, and readability. The research results showed that there 194 data and 201 processes of transitivity. The types of processes are material, mental, verbal, verbal behavior, mental behavior, relational attributive, relational identification, and existential. In term of circumstances, there are 11 types of circumstances appeared both in source text and target text, but it found different frequency. While the translation techniques that effect on the quality are established equivalent, paraphrase, variation, explicitation, modulation, natural borrowing, implicitation, compensation, transposition, discursive creation, and reduction. The application of these techniques cause some shifts in the target text, and some of them also caused by the existence of reduction. Consequently, the translation quality of transitivity almost translated accurately. There are 144 (71,57%) data were accurate and 56 (28,42%) data were less accurate. the average score of accuracy is 2,71. For the acceptability and readibility totally produce a high score of 3. It means that both aspects of acceptability and readibility is perfect.

Keywords: *Translation Quality; Transitivity; Translation Techniques*

Introduction

Translation tends to classify how equivalence works between source language and target language, House (2014:5). Some scholars have different concept of equivalence on translation. It finds translation can be equivalent by its meaning, system, structure, culture, and so on. Catford (1965:20) defines translation as the replacement of textual material in one language (SL) by equivalent textual material in another language (TL). It explains how translation can be achieved through the linguistics equivalent such grammatical or lexical. While Nida & Taber (1982: 12) classify translation as reproducing in the receptor language the closest natural equivalent of the source language message, first

in terms of meaning and secondly in terms of style. It more expresses the equivalence of meaning and style. Basically, equivalence is the fundamental of translation quality assessment. The more it is compatible, the more it produces the high quality. It can be in term of accuracy, readability, and acceptability.

The study of translation and SFL has conducted in the recent years. Both theories reveal the understanding of meaning. One of sistemic functional linguistic theories concerning with meaning is transitivity. As well-known, SFL has three components of language such as ideational, interpersonal, and textual. Transitivy involves to ideational meanings of which experiential. It views the role of language to reflect the reality of participant's experience. Transitivity constitutes a system of experience in a form of clause (Halliday,2014;Eggins,2004). Experiences may consist in some works, exactly novel or short story. These both literature works are narrative text that describes an event of an actor in a sequence of time.

Transitivity consists of three elements, those are process, participant, and circumstance, Halliday (2014) . The central of its experiential meaning is process, because a clause will never stand without the existence of process. The kinds of process in transivity are material, mental, behavioral, relational, and existential. Participant refers to actors. And circumstance is the answer of question such what, where, and how it happens. Circumstance involves location, manner, accompaniment, role, and matter. Therefore, transitivity in this context should be able to transfer the ideational meaning as well in the target text, especially on the translation quality.

Several previous studies the involvement of translation and transitivity have been conducted. Taufiq (2018) and Jafar (2020) investigate transitivity on the translation of speech and expository texts. Rusdi (2019) analyze the structure of transtivity in the translation of students translators. What distinguishes it from previous research, this research will clarify clauses based on the genre of narrative text, by determining the generic structure starting from orientation, complication, evaluation, and resolution. Furthermore, this study will analyze how translation techniques impact on the translation quality among the accuracy, acceptability, and readability.

Methodology

This study was a qualitative descriptive since it describes the translation quality of transitivy. The data were collected based on the theory of transitivity proposed by Halliday (2014). The data collection was obtained through content analysis and FGD (Focus Group Discussion). The data source is the book of The Memoirs of Sherlock Holmes and its Indonesian translation. Meanwhile, the data used were words, phrases, clauses obtained from determining the generic structure based on the stages of the narrative text. The translation technique used was theory of Molina & Albir (2002) and for the translation quality used was the theory of Nababan et al (2012).

Result and Discussion

Halliday (2014) divides transitivity into eight types, there are material, mental, verbal, verbal behavior, mental behavior, relational attributive, relational identifying, and existential. In this reseach, it has found 8 types of transitivity process. The dominan is material, because narrative text tends to express physical action of the characters. Here is the display of total data in Table 1.

Table 1. Types of Transitivity Processes in The Memoirs of Sherlock Holmes

Types of Transitivity	Total	Percentage
Material	68	33,33
Mental	35	17,15
Verbal	22	10,78
Verbal Behavior	3	1,47
Mental Behavior	12	5,88
Relational Attributive	48	23,52
Relational Identifying	4	1,96
Existential	12	5,88
	204	100

This research has 194 data, and it has 204 processes of transitivity applied in the narrative text. As shown above that material process becomes the most-used in the book of The Memoirs of Sherlock Holmes. It is proven that narrative text characteristics describe a process of doing and happening. It is in line with the kind of narrative text stated by Wiratno (2018:308), he explains narrative text tends to use material process and relational attributive process.

In addition, it has other element in transitivity namely circumstances. It refers to such time, place, condition of the experiences happened. It can be seen the types and number of circumstances used in the translation of The Memoirs of Sherlock Holmes.

Types of Circumstances in The Memoirs of Sherlock Holmes

No	Types of Circumstances	ST	TT
1	Location: Place	23	30
2	Location: Time	28	28
3	Extent	7	8
4	Manner: Quality	14	10
5	Manner: Means	2	3
6	Manner: Comparison	1	1
7	Cause: Reason	3	4
8	Cause: Purpose	1	1
9	Accompaniment	6	3
10	Matter		4
11	Role	1	
	Total	86	91

The data analysis results shown above in Table 2, there consist of different number or frequencies from both source text and target text. In the source text, it has total number 86 circumstances with 10 types. While in the targer text, it has 91 circumstances. The number of circumstances enhance in the target text, because the circumstance of place occurence is higher than it use in source text.

Translation Techniques of Transitivity System

It has described previously, there were eight types of transitivity processess used in telling or expressing the experiences of characters. To translate its structure of transitivity, it has several translation techniques to have a high quality translation. The researcher found fourteen of translation techniques applied by the translators. It can be seen in Table 2. below.

Table 2. Translation Techniques in Transitivity

No	Techniques	Total	Percentage
1	Established Equivalent	374	53.96
2	Paraphrase	83	11.97
3	Variation	57	8.22
4	Explicitation	56	8.08
5	Modulation	38	5.48
6	Natural Borrowing	26	3.75
7	Implicitation	21	3.03
8	Compensation	15	2.16
9	Transposition	8	1.15
10	Discursive Creation	5	0.72
11	Reduction	5	0.72
12	Addition	2	0.28
13	Generalization	2	0.28
14	Particuralization	1	0.14
		693	100%

Translation techniques defines as procedures to analyse and classify translation equivalence, Molina & Albir (2012:509). From 197 data, established equivalent has the highest total number applied by the translators. The use of this technique produce a high translation quality. Here is the example of the translation of transitivity system.

Data 10/TMSH/05

Mrs. Straker	awoke	at seven in the morning
actor	*material process*	*circumstance: location: time*

Mrs. Straker	bangun	keesokan harinya pada jam tujuh pagi
actor	*material process*	*circumstance: location: time*

The clauses above apply three techniques, they are established equivalent, natural borrowing, and explicitation. the word of "Mr. Straker*"* in the source language is translated into "*Mrs. Straker"* in the target language, it is called as natural borrowing technique. The word of "awoke" is translated into "*bangun*", it applied established equivalent. And it has applied the technique of explicitation as the words of "at seven in the morning" into "*keesokan harinya pada jam tujuh pagi*".

Data 12/ TMSH/05

She	dressed	herself	hastily,
actor	*material process*	*goal*	*circumstance:manner:quality*

Dia	bergegas berpakaian
actor	*material process*

The clauses also apply three tehnique such as establishd equivalent, transposition, and implicitation. Establish equivalent is used to translate the word of "she" into "*dia*" , while transposition is used to translate the word of "dressed" into "*bergegas berpakaian*", and the word "hastily" in the source text becomes implicit in the target text that is called as the technique of implicitation.

Data 17/ TMSH/05

the favorite's stall	was	empty
carrier	*relational attributive process*	*atribut*

Kuda jagoan Silver Blaze	tak ada	di kandangnya lagi
existent	*existential process*	*circumstance:location: place*

The clauses above only apply one technique that is paraphrase. "The favorite's stall was empty" translated into "*Kuda jagoan Silver Blaze tak ada di kandangnya lagi*". It aims to convey information clearer in the target text.

Data 19/ TMSH /05

About a quarter of a mile from the stables	John Straker's overcoat	was flapping	from a furze-bush.
circumstance:location: place	*actor*	*material process*	*circumstance:location: place*

Kira-kira setengah kilometer dari kandang	mereka	menemukan	jaket
circumstance:location: place	*actor*	*material process*	*goal*

The clauses above apply two kinds of translation techniques, these are established equivalent and modulation. "about a quarter of a mile from the stables" translated into "*kira-kira setengah kilometer dari kandang*", it used established equivalent. While the word of "John Straker's overcoat was flapping from a furze-bush" translated using modulation technique as "*mereka menemukan jaket*"

Translation Quality

Nababan et al (2012:44) classify the quality of translation into three points, it has accuracy, acceptability, and readability. Its quality depends on the application of techniques. Translator sometimes can not convey the source text well because of the low competencies and the use of translation techniques. This is the result of translation quality in the translation of transitivity system in narrative text. It presented in Table 3 below.

Table 3. Accuracy, Acceptability, and Readability of Transitivity System

Translation Quality		Total	Percentage	Average
Accuracy	Accurate	141	71,57%	
	Less Accurate	56	28,42%	2,71
	Inaccurate	-	-	
Acceptability	Acceptable	197	100%	
	Less Acceptable	-	-	3
	Unacceptable	-	-	
Readability	High	197	100%	
	Medium	-	-	3
	Low	-	-	

From the table above, it is shown that the translation of transitivity system almost achieve a high accuracy. It has average score 2,71. 141 clauses categorized as accurate translation, and 56 clauses included into less accurate. Furthermore, the whole data of 197 have produced the high acceptability and

readability, it means the translator could deliver the equivalent of grammatical aspect and give the reader the best understanding in the target text.

The low of translation quality in term of accuracy was due to the different system between source text and target text, so that it causes a shift in the target text. Besides, it also caused by the reduction in translating the text. Here is the classification below.

Accurate

Based on Nababan (2012:44) accuracy refers to whether the source text and target text have been equivalent or not. This concept leads to the similarity of content or messages.

Data 02/TMSH/03

as	we	sat down	together to our breakfast
	actor	*material process*	*circumstance: accompaniment*

pada suatu pagi	ketika	kami	sedang duduk menikmati sarapan.
circumstance: location: time		*actor*	*material process*

The data number 02 has been conveyed well in the target text. It is proven that the system of transitivity both source text and target text have the same process and meaning. On which the words of "we sat down" translated into "*kami sedang duduk menikmati sarapan*" is involved to the process of material. So the translation is totally accurate.

Data 20/TMSH/05

Less Accurate

Immediately beyond	there	was	a bowl-shaped depression	in the moor,
circumstance:location: place		*existential process*	*existent*	*circumstance: location: place*

Tak jauh dari situ	ada	lekukan tanah berbentuk mangkuk,
circumstance:location: place	*existential process*	*existent*

The data number 20 have the same process that is existensial, but it has a deletion in target text. So that the translation becomes less accurate. The translator do not convey the word of "in the moor" in the target text. It makes the translation to be imperfect.

Less accurate

Data 30/TMSH/09

his instincts	would have been	either to return to King's Pyland or go over to Mapleton
carrier	*relational attributive process*	*atribut*

nalurinya	akan mendorongnya untuk kembali	ke King's Pyland
actor	*material process*	*circumstance:location: place*

atau	menyeberang	ke Capleton
	material process	*circumstance:location: place*

The data number 30 occur shift because it has different system both source text and target text. In the source text, the structure of transitivity has relasional attributive process. While in the target text becomes two clauses, it has the process of material. So that this translation is less accurate.

Acceptable

According to Nababan (2012:44) acceptability refers to translation that have been in accordance with rules, norms, and cultural aspects. An accurate translation may not produce a high acceptability and it can be rejected by the target reader. There are 197 data in this research. Those whole data have been translated with a high acceptability. It means the use of translation techniques is appropiate. Here is the data example.

Data 01/TMSH/03

"I am afraid, Watson, that I shall have to go"	said	Holmes
verbiage	*verbal process*	*sayer*

"KU RASA, Watson, aku harus pergi"	kata	Holmes
verbiage	*verbal process*	*sayer*

The data number 01 involves to acceptable translation. The rater apply some techniques to translate the clause, it has established equivalent, modulation, variation, and natural borrowing.

Readibility

Nababan (1999:64) stated that readibility depends on a simple vocabulary and sentences chosen by the author. In detail, it presents understandable words so that the reader is easy to catch the meaning or points. Likewise, unfamiliar words, long and complicated sentences is more difficult to understand by target reader. Readibility basically concerns with target language.

Data 18/TMSH/05

and	there	were	no signs of his trainer.
		existential process	*existent*

dan	pelatihnya juga	tak ada	di situ
	existent	*existential process*	*circumstance:location: place*

The data number 18 contains a high score of readability because the translator used familiar and simple words that facilitate reader to understand. The translation techniques is paraphrase. In addition, the type of process both source text and target text have the same process of existential. Thus, the translator has conveyed the meaning of experience as well.

Conclusion

In summary, there are 194 data and 204 processes of transitivity found in the book of The Memoirs of Sherlock Holmes. The types of transitivity process found in this narrative text are material, mental, verbal, verbal behavior, mental behavior, relational attributive, relational identifying, and existential. In addition, it has 11 types of circumstances used in the narrative text. While the translation techniques applied in translating the structure of transitivity involve fourteen techniques. Those are

established equivalent, paraphrase, variation, explicitation, modulation, natural borrowing, implicitation, compensation, transposition, discursive creation, and reduction.

As described that this research investigate the translation of the structure of transitivity. Transitivity presents the meaning of experiences such narrative text that provides events of characters. The use of techniques impact on the translation quality of transitivity structure. It can be determined that between source text and target text have different system, so that it creates a shift and causes the translation to be less accurate. The accuracy has the average score of 2,71, but in term of acceptability and readibility toward its translation totally produce a high score of 3.

References

Catford, J. C. (1965). A linguistic theory of translation (Vol. 31). London: Oxford University Press.

Eggins, S. (2004). Introduction to systemic functional linguistics. A&c Black.

Halliday, M.A.K & Matthieessen, Christian. 2014. An Introduction to Functional Grammar Fourth Edition. Routledge Taylor & Francis Group. London and New York.

Hidayat, Taufiq N,. Nababan, Djatmika. 2019. Translation Shift of A Transitivity System in Obama and Trump's Inauguration Speech. Humaniora. 31(2) 211-220.

House, J. (2014). Translation quality assessment: Past and present. In Translation: A multidisciplinary approach (pp. 241-264). Palgrave Macmillan, London.

Jafar, Tarjana, Nababan, & Wiratno. 2018. Translation of Processes in Populer Book "Ask Barbara:100 Most-Asked Questions about Love, Sex and Relationships": A Systemic Functional Linguistics (SFL) Approach to Translation Study. ELLic: English Language and Literature International Conference Proceedings. Vol. 2, 541-546

Molina, L., & Hurtado Albir, A. (2002). Translation techniques revisited: A dynamic and functionalist approach. Meta: Journal des Traducteurs/Meta: Translators' Journal, 47(4), 498-512.

Nababan, M. (1999). Teori Menerjemah Bahasa Inggris. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar

Nababan, M., & Nuraeni, A. (2012). Pengembangan model penilaian kualitas terjemahan.

Nida, Eugene A., and Charles R. Taber (1982). The Theory and Practice of Translation, With Special References to Bible Translating,. Leiden: Brill.

Rusdi, Rudy & Tarigan. 2018. Transitivity Analysis of The Translation of Student Translators. ICLA: Internastional Conference on Languages and Arts. Vol 301, 606-612.

Wiratno, Tri. 2018. Pengantar Ringkas Linguistik Sistemik Fungsional. Pustaka Pelajar. Yogyakarta

Copyrights